Cyber Diplomacy: Forging Pakistan's Foreign Policy in the Digital World

* Shahzad Munir

M.Phil Scholar, Muslim Youth University, Islamabad.
Corresponding Author: dg@numl.edu.pk

Muhammad Asghar Mahmood

M.Phil Scholar, Muslim Youth University, Islamabad.
Rimsha Malik

M.Phil Scholar, Muslim Youth University, Islamabad.

Abstract

At the dawn of the 21st century, technology has transformed civilizations all over the world through the phenomenon of globalization. Besides compressing time and space, globalization has upgraded the efficiency of human structures and procedures to function at optimum levels. With the increased number of participants in the digital space, global contestation has commenced in pursuance of accruing maximum benefits. State-driven strategic relations have also been influenced by this phenomenon of the information age and greater dependence on technologically oriented practices has led to exploring new dynamics and dimensions of diplomacy. Besides conventional diplomacy, a need has been felt to engage diplomats around the world through the digital medium for effective conflict management. Cyber diplomacy is therefore defined as the strategic management of international affairs using digital networks to foster engagements among diverse nations for promoting global peace and stability. The amalgamation of technology and diplomacy has offered several opportunities besides challenges. Off late Pakistan has also stepped into this domain and has launched various foreign policy initiatives to remain relevant, however, it seems a distant call to mature its digital diplomatic structures. Pakistan currently faces adverse technological and infrastructural issues that hamper its performance and efficiency in digital conflict resolution. Therefore, to forge Pakistan's foreign policy in the digital world, a comprehensive strategy is required to streamline and further its objectives and interests at an unprecedented pace matching the globalized digital architecture. With this pretext, the paper will examine the impact of technology in the diplomatic sphere while highlighting Pakistan's prospects and challenges in the cyber domain. Policy recommendations are also proffered to cement the efforts of Pakistan's government in implementing the cyber diplomatic regime.

Keywords: Globalization, Foreign Policy, Diplomacy, Cyberspace, Strategy, and Conflicts.

Introduction

The phenomenon of globalization has modeled every aspect of human life, mainly seen as the compression of time and space at the grand strategic level. International relations among the states have also been shaped by this phenomenon in the information age and reliance on technologically driven diplomatic practices is growing leading to newly explored dimensions of diplomacy. Various factors create stress on national governments to remodel their foreign policy structures for the development of mass engagements as the focus of their political and diplomatic outreach. These factors include enhanced cultural exchanges, media explosions, plurality of populace, interdependence, and enhanced globalization. A transition has therefore been observed from traditional diplomacy to cyber diplomacy to compete for rapidly paced strategic engagements and management of international affairs. ***The plethora of social media platforms and escalated use of computer networks have given an impetus for realizing the true potential of digital diplomacy***. The diplomatic as well as technological competence for the application of these tools is thus required to acquire desired outcomes.

Historically, the nature, scope, and tools for practicing diplomacy have been transforming with the change in the strategic environment. In the early 20th century, it mostly remained restricted government to government direct communication. However, the invention of the radio along with the Bolshevik revolution of 1917 altered the traditional practices of diplomacy. Radio as the tool of diplomacy enabled political leaders to conversate directly with the populace, marking the beginning of public diplomacy. This Public diplomacy led to the appointments of technical Attache in diplomatic missions and the establishment of media channels by major powers. Today with the advent of the world wide web of numerous technologies, interconnectivity has been at the forefront in the conduct of foreign policy across the globe.

Diplomacy is pursued as a tool of foreign policy to preserve national interest and manage cordial and peaceful relations with other states through negotiations. Cyber diplomacy has been used as a policy tool by contemporary modern states for building the architecture of global politics. Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs), particularly the Internet, provide innovative ways to stir up international relations with no physical boundaries. Since technology has revolutionized all aspects of human life, it has also diversified the ways and means of constructive engagement for conflict resolution by peaceful means. ***Cyber Diplomacy, also known as a "mystery and magic", has unfortunately remained a mystery rather than a magic for Pakistan's diplomatic efforts to forge its foreign policy in the digital world***. A greater realization

has been felt in policy circles to adapt diplomatic practices to the digital age and manage foreign relations at a competing pace. This paper underlines various dynamics of cyber diplomacy as a tool for the conduct of foreign policy. *Further, the paper explains Pakistan's diplomatic imperatives of adopting digital diplomacy and the challenges that the country faces in this regard besides recommending the way forward.*

Cyber Diplomacy as a Foreign Policy Tool

Diplomacy may also be defined as the processes employed by foreign offices of the states to manage and shape the international environment while avoiding physical violence (Cull, 2010). Cyber diplomacy as a foreign policy tool is the increasing application of ICTs and computer networks by a country to practice public diplomacy in the contemporary globalized world. ***Cyber diplomacy has variously been referred to as diplomacy, digital diplomacy, net diplomacy, #diplomacy, 21st-century statecraft, etc***. Each term shares a common perspective: the use of ICTs, such as the Internet, to achieve diplomatic objectives. ***It aims to influence public attitudes, who use different digital media tools, for the advancement of national interests by a state***. Beyond conventional diplomacy, cyber diplomacy refers to governments' efforts to influence public opinion in foreign countries; the interaction among private groups and interests across countries; the reporting of foreign affairs and its policy relevance; communication between diplomats and foreign correspondents; and the activity of inter-cultural communications (Golan et al., 2015, p. 2).

Cyber diplomacy is a platform where a diplomat can directly relate to one or more countries with the help of social media tools. Diplomats with proper planning and strategic approaches can achieve various objectives for the betterment or growth of countries within a short time. Cyber diplomacy is a time and cost-effective approach for diplomats to speak, engage, and influence the audience directly and to rectify their memoranda in international relations. However, proper checks and balances are required to justify such an open narrative in public (Melissen, 2005).

There are various dimensions of cyber diplomacy. It resides in both hard and soft power dynamics (Figure 1). Most importantly it is the main instrument of coercive power application directed against the target audience for extending influence in the cognitive domain. It may be driven by state or non-state actors for establishing strategic communications through all available mass media

Figure 1: Dimensions of Cyber Diplomacy

tools. It could also be used to facilitate mediation among warring factions to bring them to the negotiation table. Its availability and accessibility remain the most important characteristics for successful use of diplomatic practices. Principal issues on its agenda include cybersecurity, cybercrime, confidence-building, internet freedom, and internet governance.

Cyber Diplomacy in Contemporary International Relations

Cyberspace has been declared as a globally competing political space shaped by shared values, dominating cultures, and competing national interests. Digital politicization has introduced a new great game wherein diplomats have found their playing arenas. This phenomenon has marked the end of the era of technical experts' dominance in cyberspace. The US International Strategy for Cyberspace, published in 2011 can be declared as the first government initiative to focus on the global aspects of cyber issues. Various priorities have been laid in the defined strategy to establish a universal framework highlighting the issues including internet security and governance through mutually accepted rules and regulations. The objectives set for the strategy for its application in cyberspace depend on three foundational pillars: "*diplomacy, defense, and development*" (3Ds). For this purpose, the US State Department has established a new Office to coordinate cyber issues (Barrinha & Renard, 2017). The main tasks assigned to this office are (US State Department website, 2017):

- To coordinate cyber diplomacy initiatives around the world.

- To establish liaison of the US State Department with its subordinate organs and federal agencies on associated issues.

- To render advice to officials of the department on cyber issues and engagements.

There has been a greater realization amongst various countries around the world for formulating their national strategies to address global cyberspace issues. However, Pakistan seems to have just taken a fresh start in this domain. National Cyber Security Policy 2021 and Digital Pakistan Policy 2023 issued by the government of Pakistan have set prime objectives to promote e-governance and integrate other federal and provincial ministries. However, the integration of these policies in respective policy frameworks by ministries and departments is being pursued at a slow pace (Ministry of Information Technology and Telecommunication, 2021 & 2023).

These policies have influenced the Ministry of Foreign Affairs as well which has undertaken various initiatives including organizing a virtual capacity-building training workshop in collaboration with the Digital Media Wing, Ministry of Information and Broadcasting. This initiative was a great success since more than 150 Pakistani diplomats participated in the training.

The focus of the workshop was to highlight the significance of the diplomat's digital toolkit by adapting to modern technologies and social media platforms. This initiative was followed by the launching of a Digital Media Dashboard powered by Artificial Intelligence (AI) tools in the ministry to monitor diplomatic engagements in the cyber domain. (Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2021). The FO of Pakistan has been very recently using digital tools for the advancement of the digital agenda. A few digital diplomacy initiatives by the Foreign Office include (Saghir, 2023):

- **Digital Dashboard**. It monitors the continued diplomatic engagements with various nations around the world. It also assists in strategic communication including the exchange of digital material. This initiative has offered a successful diplomatic platform for targeting audiences on the most popular and relevant subjects around the world.

- **Twitter Diplomacy.** It is an initiative launched by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs in 2017 to engage the Pakistani diaspora abroad to enhance its influence and reputation at a strategic level. Utilizing this social media platform, more than five lac people are followers of the official Twitter account. It deals with the subjects of international affairs which concern the foreign policy matters of Pakistan. This initiative has helped in occupying much-needed cyberspace to build a national narrative for the projection and preservation of the national interests of Pakistan.

- **e-Visa System.** This system was introduced in 2019 to make investment and travel easier. The system is designed to facilitate foreigners visiting Pakistan to apply for visas digitally and acquire them timely.

- **Online Portal for Overseas Pakistanis**. Established in June 2021, the idea was to ensure the participation of dual nationals and Pakistani diaspora in the democratic process of the country. The portal permits registering the vote besides informing them about the latest updates on relevant issues. This initiative has assisted the Election Commission of Pakistan in increasing the voters' turnout thereby maturing the political processes of Pakistan.

Pakistan's Digital Diplomacy: Prospects & Challenges

Advancements in information technology have impacted all aspects of life. Diplomacy, a vital component of statecraft, has evolved from old methods to modern digital diplomacy. The digitalization of diplomacy has led to a significant shift in the job profile of diplomats (Baissultanova & Baktybekova, 2020), resulting in increased stakeholder involvement. Social

media has increased public participation and impact on foreign policy. Foreign policymakers should equip diplomatic missions with digital tools to address growing technological trends and effectively pursue foreign policy. Developed countries with strong information technology capabilities swiftly adopted this new diplomatic approach to achieve their foreign policy goals. Developing countries, such as Pakistan, are challenged to effectively use digital diplomacy to advance their national interests in the global arena. Diplomacy in Pakistan is in its early stages. Pakistan's growing population is increasing the number of internet users, although lawmakers and foreign policy professionals still have restricted access.

Renowned cyber diplomat Chris Painter highlights that maintaining computer security coalitions calls for diplomatic abilities and mindsets in addition to technical teams. Due to the increasing complexity of cybercrime incidents and the significant media coverage they have received over the past few decades, cyber security laws have progressed in two directions: first, they have moved up the executive ladder to influence politicians and decision-makers, and second, they have paralleled the concerns of the general public across the country and the threats that threaten them. Nationally speaking, numerous governments have provided updated cyber-security policy blueprints. Today, there is a greater emphasis placed globally on the strategic defense position regarding nearly every facet of cyber security. This is evident in the increasing prominence of cyberattacks in global forums, which encourage the use of "cyber-military" tactics in addition to joint endeavors to achieve offensive capabilities. The United Nations has developed guidelines for state behavior and action in cyberspace that maintain security and peace (Roy, 2021).

It was once said by "French Prime Minister Clemenceau" that the military should not be the only ones handling war since it is too serious. In the same way, cyberspace is thought to be too important to be handled by technicians alone. That being said, there is a widespread belief that cyberspace was created by technologists, which gives rise to the notion that only technical specialists ought to handle its problems. But whether it comes to cybersecurity or internet governance, the main

48

problems in cyberspace are fundamentally human and go beyond technical difficulties (Malik, 2023c).

Specifically, they take the form of geopolitical and political difficulties. The issues surrounding Internet governance go beyond technical aspects of Internet management and instead, become highly politicized discussions about global public goods and societal management. Digital diplomacy has become a revolutionary force in the era of technology, changing the conventional field of statecraft. Through the use of online forums and social media, digital diplomacy promotes a more inclusive kind of diplomacy by facilitating transparent and direct communication with audiences around the world. Digital platforms, while powerful in influencing public opinion, can have certain drawbacks, such as the quick dissemination of false information. With the growth of the internet and the ubiquity of social media, the transition to digital diplomacy accelerated and made it possible for state actors to interact directly with audiences abroad (Mehdi, 2023).

Pakistan is currently facing numerous cyber diplomacy issues, which should be addressed by establishing a solid foundation of digital infrastructure by information security legislation. Recognizing cyberattacks as a danger necessitates a strong push to develop cyber security infrastructure, policy, and reaction teams. In this regard, Pakistan's first national cyber security strategy was authorized on July 27, 2021, and the country's Cyber Incident Response Team (CSIRT) functions in several industries.

Pakistan opted for digital diplomacy in response to the COVID-19 outbreak, shifting from traditional to digital avenues for diplomatic communication (Khursheed, 2023). The Ministry of Foreign Affairs and related embassies struggled to be watchful in digital diplomacy even with their virtual diplomatic presence since they lacked a strategy statement to guide them. With inconsistent social media posts from senior officials, the nation is behind its regional rivals in digital diplomacy. Pakistan's early adoption of digital diplomacy has its share of chances and difficulties, particularly

49

in light of the youth's extensive usage of social media. Although digital diplomacy provides a variety of instruments, embassies face difficulties due to an unorganized framework (Hafiza & Ashraf, 2023).

In Pakistan, 64% of the population is under thirty years old (Arab News, 2018). With time, this segment of the population will acquire more sophisticated information technology skills, and Pakistan can benefit from its technological know-how by projecting a more positive image of the country abroad. In addition to that, foreign policymakers in Pakistan realize that to cope with merging issues in global diplomacy, Pakistan needs to implement digital means of communication for actively pursuing their foreign policy in this age of technological interconnectedness. Iftekhar and Bokhari (2022) suggest that there exist opportunities for digital diplomacy that lend credence to the notion of utilizing digital media technologies in the course of diplomatic efforts with other nations.

Pakistan has gradually expanded its cyber security regulations since the early 2000s, including legislation such as the Electronic Transactions Ordinance in 2002 and the Prevention of Electronic Crimes Act in 2016. The National Cyber Security Policy (2021) highlights a comprehensive strategy including both the public and private sectors and places a strong emphasis on deterrence, governance, ecosystem preservation, and awareness (MOITT, 2021). Despite confronting state-sponsored cyber-attacks, Pakistan is continuously upgrading its cybersecurity measures and engaging with international partners. Effective protection of Pakistan's digital infrastructure will come from the application of these rules and ongoing enhancements, such as resource distribution, development of a cybersecurity culture, and cooperation. Pakistan ranks 79th on the global cybersecurity ranking. As new kinds of warfare endanger nations, terminology such as 'cyberwars', 'cyberattacks', and 'cyber-intrusions' have entered the discourse of state security. Pakistan has relatively competent cyber warfare capabilities and has already carried out several cyber strikes against its opponents. It is unclear what precise cyber deterrence methods Pakistan employs,

50

although the government is likely to use a combination of defensive and offensive capabilities to deter prospective cyber-attacks (Malik, 2023a).

Diplomatic practices have undergone a substantial transformation due to the advancement of communication technology, which has rendered conventional and time-consuming procedures outdated. Geographical separations between governments and embassies, which were once a barrier, are no longer significant because of the variety and speed of communication made possible by technological developments (Frontiers, 2020b). Diplomatic missions can quickly provide feedback to their home state and actively engage in activities thanks to digital communication. The ability of digital diplomacy to reach a broad audience and involve the public in decision-making is one noteworthy feature.

Using Niccolo Machiavelli's unsuccessful political career as an example, the story argues that his approach failed because the public was not involved in it. It suggests that had social media platforms been around when he did, he might have gathered a sizable public opinion to help him make better decisions. With social media offering instantaneous and rapid reactions, information and communication technology advancements enable diplomats to obtain critical information quickly. Digital media is vital for conducting diplomatic operations and interacting with the overseas diaspora in developing nations like Pakistan, where electronic media encounters obstacles like blackouts and censorship (Ahmad & Rafique, 2016). The understanding of the role that digital platforms play in promoting and molding Pakistan's foreign image is demonstrated by former Prime Minister Imran Khan Niazi's creation of a digital media wing. The anticipated rise in internet users in Pakistan is anticipated to have an impact on digital diplomacy competencies, underscoring the revolutionary influence of technology on diplomatic operations in the modern era.

Current technical developments are pushing countries towards more affordable technologies in the modern era. Comparing digital diplomacy to traditional diplomacy, costs are much lower, making

51

it an effective instrument for diplomatic operations. Foreign policy elites are especially drawn to the financial advantages; this is demonstrated by the significant cost reductions resulting from virtual presentations at international forums (Ahmad & Rafique, 2016). For example, in 2020 and 2021, Pakistan's former prime minister Imran Khan significantly reduced expenses by addressing the UN General Assembly virtually, offering a practical substitute for expensive in-person visits.

Pakistan's current condition of digital diplomacy is appalling. Social media platforms, an essential part of digital diplomacy that countries use to cultivate a positive worldwide image, are not being adequately utilized by Pakistani embassies abroad. Digital diplomacy, in all its manifestations, is vital to fostering positive attitudes and fortifying bilateral ties between nations (Harris, 2013). As the foreign policy environment of Pakistan changes and new trends emerge, digital diplomacy is still in its infancy there. A dispassionate analysis of Pakistan's top leaders' social media presence indicates that the platforms are not being effectively used to further the nation's foreign policy goals.

According to sources within the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Pakistan falls behind regional and developed states in digital diplomacy due to the absence of a centralized mechanism regulating diplomatic activity. Digital diplomacy is a novel idea in diplomacy, but it also has advantages and disadvantages. Social media, an essential element of digital diplomacy, on the one hand, helps states deal with social concerns and allows for widespread cooperation for the promotion of human rights despite media blackouts and censorship. However, there are hazards associated with using digital diplomacy as a tool of statecraft (Ismail, 2020). Even with all of its difficulties, the core of digital diplomacy ends up being more advantageous. Pakistan and other nations cannot afford to fall behind in this area. Although every state faces difficulties in this type of diplomacy, regardless of size or level of development, Pakistan and other nations may encounter several difficulties concerning digital diplomacy, some of which are covered below.

Technological Stagnation

Pakistan's inadequate advancement in information technology presents serious obstacles for the country's digital diplomacy. In the "Human Capital Development and Research" pillar, Pakistan is ranked 117th out of 132 countries, however, it is ranked 99th in the Global Innovation Index. Advances in this field are hampered by the nation's precarious political system and economy. Digital diplomacy employs a range of software programs, digital media channels, and social media platforms. Pakistan has used digital methods, including participating virtually in summits and conferences, despite the COVID-19 epidemic. Unfortunately, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs does not have a well-organized structure in place to oversee diplomatic activities, primarily as a result of insufficient advancements in information technology.

Elite Foreign Policy Circles' Reluctance towards Digital Integration

The failure of stakeholders to conform to Pakistan's digitization culture presents another major obstacle to diplomacy in that country. Pakistan's digitization culture is confronted with difficulties since diplomatic missions and personnel lack the necessary knowledge. Many officials are reluctant to employ digital tools for diplomacy because they lack technological know-how. Furthermore, a lot of ambassadors and diplomatic missions only know how to use the most basic social media platforms, making it difficult for them to properly represent Pakistan online. The low number of active Facebook and Twitter users and the ineffectiveness of digital diplomacy are clear indicators of this disobedience.

Leadership Lapses

A noteworthy obstacle to Pakistan's digital diplomacy is the lack of efficacious digital reform initiatives by the country's leadership. Among its neighbors, like India, the nation lacks a centralized e-system and centralized digital media strategy. Just thirty percent of foreign embassies utilize social media to present a positive picture of Pakistan. The Ministry of Foreign Affairs does not have a reliable way to update its social media presence, and no reform initiative to expand the

53

use of digital diplomacy has been started by any of the succeeding administrations. On the other hand, to enhance its favorable reputation, India has launched historic initiatives like "Incredible India" and "Digital India" (Group, 2021).

Privacy Concerns

Foreign policy has suffered as a result of poor nations' increased vulnerability due to Wiki leaks and cyberattacks. A report published in January 2021 by the private cyber threat intelligence company Sophos Labs revealed some very concerning findings. The research claims that malicious versions of Android apps and websites exist, including the Pakistan Citizen Portal app, which is available on the Google Play Store and was released by the Pakistani government (Kohli, Brandt, 2021). These websites and applications are infected with malware that can read private messages, and GPS data, record phone calls, and steal and exfiltrate sensitive information such as CNIC numbers, passport details, usernames, and Facebook account passwords. Hackers used torjanized versions of trustworthy applications and websites to observe and spy on inhabitants of Pakistan through cyberspace (Waqas Ahmad, 2019).

Information and communication technologies (ICT) have become increasingly important to Pakistani society as a result of the country's progressive establishment of a cyber footprint (Andi et al., 2022). Pakistan's national security is faced with numerous issues due to the uncontrolled nature of cyberspace, along with the country's growing dependence on ICT platforms. Agencies with hostile intentions are fully exploiting Pakistan's unprotected cyberspace to threaten the country's security. Such targeted internet attacks against Pakistan are exemplified by the EU DisinfoLab report (Jahangir, 2020). Some of the cybersecurity issues facing the State include an increase in cyberattacks against both public and private websites, fake news, targeted disinformation campaigns, phishing attacks, Denial of Service (DoS), and Distributed Denial of Service (DDoS) assaults (Alawida et al., 2022).

Recommendations:

In the backdrop of prospects and challenges of cyber diplomacy in Pakistan, the following policy recommendations are proffered to make it an effective tool for foreign policy:

National Cybersecurity Policy:

- A comprehensive national cybersecurity policy to be formulated delineating the national strategy for its implementation within a given policy framework. It should incorporate all stakeholders with a clear road map for infrastructure development besides devising means for establishing cyber security architecture.

- A coordination mechanism among all stakeholders should indeed be given priority in the implementation plan. For cyber diplomacy, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs should take a lead role in the transformation from conventional to digital practices.

Global Integration:

- Cyber diplomacy tools should actively engage and integrate various cybersecurity forums and setups at the regional and global levels including organs of the United Nations.

- Integration with global cyber security regimes be ensured to fully utilize the diplomatic potential for cementing bilateral and multilateral engagement around the world.

Capacity Enhancement:

- Investment in robust and state-of-the-art cyber technology be done with foolproof security mechanisms in place to safeguard against cyber threats.

- Human resource development and management be given priority while introducing technical skill development programs to transform them into a proficient cybersecurity workforce.

- Collaborating with diplomats of developed countries with acquired technical skills in digital practices.

Public-Private Partnership:

- Promoting partnerships with the private sector, media channels, and NGOs through defined mechanisms of information sharing besides seeking advice from industrial experts in policy formulation.

- This initiative would also enhance the parameter of security in the digital domain.

Legal Framework:

- Adopting international legal framework in cyber security to ensure correct diplomatic practices in line with prevailing rules and recommendations.

- Cyber criminals and cases of breach of legal cyber diplomatic practices be dealt with high hands.

Diplomatic Outreach:

- Strong diplomatic ties while utilizing the cyber world to extend diplomatic reach even to those states where diplomatic missions are not deployed.

- Digital participation in international diplomatic forums regularly to share the state's stance while adopting best practices. This would reinforce the state's narrative on various issues of the world.

Cybersecurity Awareness:

- Awareness of diplomats and general masses on the threats of cyber security be created. A well-informed public can help to improve national cybersecurity by implementing secure internet behaviors and reporting suspicious activity.

- Public awareness initiatives should target individuals, businesses, and government institutions.

Incident Response and Attribution:

- Creating effective incident response mechanisms to address cyber threats quickly. Methods be created for attributing cyberattacks to specific actors or entities.

- Collaboration with international partners to investigate and attribute cyber events, encouraging accountability in cyberspace.

Cross-Sector Collaboration:

- Encourage collaboration between various industries, such as banking, healthcare, energy, and transportation.

- Establish sector-specific cybersecurity rules and standards to secure critical infrastructure.

- Work together with industry associations to share threat intelligence and best practices.

Regular Cybersecurity Exercises:

- Regular cybersecurity exercises to be conducted with government agencies, especially the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, private sector groups, and key stakeholders.

- These exercises assist in evaluating reaction skills, uncovering weaknesses, and increasing overall readiness for cybersecurity threats.

Conclusion. Cyber diplomacy is a reality of the 21st century with unquestionable consequences in the international digital arena which is conflictual and amoral. Pakistan has kicked off its journey in cyberspace to remain relevant however, it will have to face several challenges of technological, infrastructural, and diplomatic inadequacies. To deal with cyber diplomacy initiatives, proposed tactics must be reassessed and updated regularly to reflect evolving cyber threats. Implementing the proffered guidelines will result in a more secure, reliable, and long-lasting cyber-physical system, which contributes to a more mature cyber diplomacy framework. A firm national resolve is therefore needed to execute cyber strategies in the diplomatic domain for securing and furthering the national interest of Pakistan.

References

Arab News. (2018, May 4). *UNDP: Pakistan has largest youth population in country's history*.

Arab News. https://www.arabnews.com/node/1296716/world

Ahmad, I., & Rafiq, A. (Eds.). (2016). *Pakistan's democratic transition: Change and persistence*.

Taylor & Francis.

Alawida, M., Omolara, A. E., Abiodun, O. I., & Al-Rajab, M. (2022). A deeper look into

cybersecurity issues in the wake of Covid-19: A survey. *Journal of King Saud University -*

Computer and Information Sciences, *34*(10), 8176–8206.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jksuci.2022.08.003

Andi, D. H. K., Hayat, S., Saleem, F., & Meena, U. (2022). Information And Communication

Technologies (ICT) As Social Innovation And Public Governance Tool For A

Developing Country. *Journal of Positive School Psychology*, *6*(8), 4167–4182.

https://journalppw.com/index.php/jpsp/article/view/10563

Barrinha, A., & Renard, T. (2017). Cyber-diplomacy: The making of an international society in the

digital age. *Global Affairs*, *3*(4-5), 353–364.

https://doi.org/10.1080/23340460.2017.1414924

Baissultanova, K. Ch., & Baktybekova, B. B. (2020, January 1). On the issue of digital diplomacy

in the context of public diplomacy in modern international relations..

https://dspace.enu.kz/bitstream/handle/data/17650/on-the-issue-of-digital-diplomacyin-

the-context-of-public-diplomacy-inmodern-internationalrelatio.pdf?sequence=1&is

Allowed=y

Cull, N. J. (2010). Public diplomacy: Seven lessons for its future from its past. Place Branding and

Public Diplomacy, 6(1), 12. https://doi.org/10.1057/pb.2010.4

Golan, G. J., Yang, S.U., & Kinsey, D. F. (2015). *International public relations and public*

diplomacy: Communication and engagement (p. 2). New York: Peter Lang.

58

Group, L. (2021). *Incredible India | Our Country and Our Pride Of Labh Group*. Labh Group.

Retrieved February 9, 2024, from https://labhgroup.com/labhopedia/incredible-india/

Frontiers, D. (2020a, October 20). *Technologies changing diplomatic practices: Pre and post-Covid-19 reality*. Orfonline.org. https://www.orfonline.org/expert-speak/technologies-changing-diplomatic-practices-pre-and-post-covid19-reality

Hafiza, S., & Ashraf. (2023). Digital Diplomacy In Pakistan. *Prospects and Challenges. Global Political Review*, *VIII*(I), 8–18. https://doi.org/10.31703/gpr.2023(VIII-I).02

Harris, B. (2013). Diplomacy 2.0: The Future of Social Media in Nation Branding. Exchange: The Journal of Public Diplomacy, 4(1), 17–32.

 https://surface.syr.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi? article=1032&context=exchange

Ismail, N. (2020). Diplomacy in the Age of the Internet Challenges and Prospects. *Www.academia.edu*, 5–6. https://www.academia.edu/47753287/Dipl

Jahangir, R. (2020, December 10). *Indian network lobbying against Pakistan exposed*. DAWN.COM. https://www.dawn.com/news/1594928

Kohli, Brandt, P., Andrew. (2021, January 12). *New Android spyware targets users in Pakistan*. Sophos News. https://news.sophos.com/en-us/2021/01/12/new-android-spyware-targets-users-in-pakistan/

Khursheed, L. (2023). Digital Diplomacy and Globalization. *Pakistan Horizon*, *76*(3), 61–74. https://www.pakistan-horizon.piia.org.pk/index.php/pakistan-horizon/article/view/309

Mehdi, D. S. M. U. and F. (2023, October 26). *The Evolving Landscape of Digital International Relations*. Stratheia.

Malik, R. (2023b, April 16). *Is cyber technology the perfect weapon?* The Nation. https://www.nation.com.pk/16-Apr-2023/is-cyber-technology-the-perfect-weapon

Malik, R. (2023a, February 12). *Cyber deterrence*. The Nation. https://www.nation.com.pk/12-Feb-2023/cyber-deterrence

Malik, R. (2023c, November 21). *Cyber diplomacy dynamics*. Pakistan Observer.

https://pakobserver.net/cyber-diplomacy-dynamics/

Melissen, J. (2005). *The New Public Diplomacy Soft Power in International Relations*.

PALGRAVE MACMILLAN.

https://culturaldiplomacy.org/academy/pdf/research/books/soft_power/The_New_Public_

Diplomacy.pdf

Ministry of Information Technology and Telecommunication. (2023). *Digital Pakistan Policy* (p.

7).   https://moib.gov.pk/Downloads/Policy/DIGITAL_PAKISTAN_POLICY%2822-05-

2018%29.pdf

Ministry of Foreign Affairs. (2021, April 20). *PRESS RELEASE*. Mofa.gov.pk.

https://mofa.gov.pk/press-release-413

Ministry of Information Technology and Telecommunication. (2021). *Government of Pakistan

National   Cyber   Security   Policy   2021*.

https://moitt.gov.pk/SiteImage/Misc/files/National%20Cyber%20Security%20Policy%202

021%20Final.pdf

MOITT. (2021). *Government of Pakistan National Cyber Security Policy 2021*.

https://moitt.gov.pk/SiteImage/Misc/files/National%20Cyber%20Security%20Policy%20

2021%20Final.pdf

Roy, S. (2021, June 17). *Weaponization of Cyberspace*. Diplomatist.

https://diplomatist.com/2021/06/17/weaponization-of-cyberspace

Saghir, J. (2023, July 17). *The Foreign Office in Pakistan Goes Digital*. Paradigm Shift.

https://www.paradigmshift.com.pk/pakistan-foreign-office-digital/

Waqas Ahmad, I. Y. (2019, March 27). *Pakistan's cyberspace at the mercy of hackers*. The

Express   Tribune.   https://tribune.com.pk/story/1938526/pakistans-cyberspace-mercy-

hackers